EVALUATION OF ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} AND TEEM PILOT PROJECTS

Final Report
July 8, 1996

 Prepared for:
California Public Utilities Commission
Commission Advisory and Compliance Division

 Prepared by:
George Edgar
Charles A. Goldman\textsuperscript{*}
Barbara J. McKellar
Edward Carroll

 With Assistance From:
Martin Kushler\textsuperscript{*}
Wayne DeForest

Wisconsin Energy Conservation Corporation
3120 International Lane
Madison, WI 53704
608-249-9322

\textsuperscript{*}Independent Consultant
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OVERVIEW OF ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} AND TEEM PILOTS</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PILOT RESULTS</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE}</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. TEEM</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PILOTS</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARKET IMPACT OF THE PILOTS</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPETITIVE IMPACT OF THE PILOTS</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMPLICATIONS OF RESTRUCTURED UTILITY INDUSTRIES</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND AND HISTORY</td>
<td>1-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OBJECTIVES OF STUDY AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS</td>
<td>1-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>1-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Questions</td>
<td>1-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METHODOLOGY OF THE REPORT</td>
<td>1-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT</td>
<td>1-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIMITATIONS ON INFORMATION FOR THIS EVALUATION</td>
<td>1-9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. DESCRIPTION OF THE PILOT PROGRAMS</td>
<td>2-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OVERVIEW</td>
<td>2-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. HISTORY OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} CONCEPT</td>
<td>2-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORIGINS OF THE ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} CONCEPT</td>
<td>2-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DESIGN OF THE ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} PROGRAM</td>
<td>2-5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMMISSION APPROVAL</td>
<td>2-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPERATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE DESIGN</td>
<td>2-13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. HISTORY OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE TEEM PILOT</td>
<td>2-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORIGINS OF THE TEEM CONCEPT</td>
<td>2-16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DESIGN OF THE TEEM PILOT</td>
<td>2-17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS AND PROGRAM TRACKING</td>
<td>2-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPERATIONS AND ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS</td>
<td>2-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPROVAL BY THE COMMISSION</td>
<td>2-27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
C. COMPARISON OF THE SIMILARITIES AND DIFFERENCES BETWEEN THE ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} AND TEEM PILOT DESIGNS ............................................. 2-27

1. Pilot Design Similarities ............................................. 2-27
2. Differences Between the Pilot Designs ..................................... 2-29

3. RESULTS OF THE ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} PILOT ............................................. 3-1
A. SCOPE OF PILOT PROGRAM ............................................. 3-1
   Marketing Contacts .................................................. 3-1
   Final Agreements: Scope of Customer Sectors .......................... 3-1
   Effectiveness of ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} by Customer Sectors ............... 3-3
B. FINAL AGREEMENTS: PROJECT SIZE, COSTS AND ENERGY/RESOURCE SAVERS ............................................. 3-3
   Comprehensiveness of Projects ....................................... 3-6
C. LONG-TERM CONTRACTS/SUCCESS OF ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} EFFORTS ............................................. 3-7
   Federal Government Sector .......................................... 3-8
   Institutional/Governmental Sector .................................... 3-9
   Large Commercial and Industrial Sector ................................ 3-10
D. FINANCIAL RESULTS AND USE OF RATEPAYER FUNDS ....................... 3-10
   Ratepayer-Funded Pilot Costs ....................................... 3-10
   Financial Results of the ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} Projects .................. 3-13
   ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} Pilot Program Adjustment Mechanism ....................... 3-15
E. ENVEST\textsuperscript{SCE} PILOT INTERACTION WITH SERVICE PROVIDERS ....................... 3-15
SUMMARY ........................................................................... 3-18

4. RESULTS OF THE TEEM PILOT ............................................. 4-1
OVERVIEW ........................................................................... 4-1
MARKETING CONTACTS ............................................. 4-1
FINAL AGREEMENTS ............................................. 4-3
USE OF SERVICE PROVIDER NETWORK ............................................. 4-4
SUMMARY ........................................................................... 4-5

5. PILOT ORGANIZATION AND IMPLEMENTATION ............................................. 5-1
OVERVIEW ........................................................................... 5-1
A. ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} PILOT ............................................. 5-1
   Organizational Structure of ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} ....................... 5-1
   Administrative Structure ............................................. 5-1
   ENvest\textsuperscript{SCE} Staffing ............................................. 5-4
   Interrelation Between Units ............................................. 5-5
Operating and Administrative Expenses ................................................................. 5-6
Perception of Purpose ................................................................................................. 5-8
Assessment of Operation of ENvestSCE ................................................................. 5-8
SERVICE PROVIDER SELECTION CRITERIA AND PROCESS ............................. 5-9
Service Provider Qualification Criteria, Selection, and Timetable ............................. 5-9
Role of Service Provider ......................................................................................... 5-11
Service Provider Selection For Customer Projects .................................................. 5-12
Assessment of the ENvestSCE Service Provider Selection Process ..................... 5-13
CUSTOMER SELECTION/CRITERIA/MARKETING .................................................... 5-15
Timeline/Development of Staff Capability ............................................................... 5-15
Nature of Marketing Efforts ...................................................................................... 5-15
Use of SCE Information/Personnel for Marketing .................................................... 5-17
Assessment of Use of SCE Information and Resources for Marketing .................... 5-18
Presentation to Customers ......................................................................................... 5-19
CRITERIA FOR PROJECT DEVELOPMENT AND SELECTION ....................... 5-19
Total Resource Cost (TRC) Test .............................................................................. 5-19
Opportunity for Savings ......................................................................................... 5-20
Creditworthiness of Customer ................................................................................ 5-20
Assessment of Project Selection Criteria and Application ........................................... 5-21
Financing Implementation ....................................................................................... 5-22
SUMMARY .................................................................................................................. 5-22
B. TEEM PILOT .......................................................................................................... 5-23
Organizational and Administrative Structure of Teem ............................................. 5-23
Operating and Administrative Expenses .............................................................. 5-25
Assessment of Operation of TEEM ......................................................................... 5-25
Service Provider Selection Criteria and Process .................................................... 5-27
Assessment of the TEEM Service Provider Selection Process ................................ 5-27
Customer Selection/Criteria/Marketing ................................................................. 5-27
Presentation to Customers/Utility Intangible "Assets" .............................................. 5-30
Criteria for Project Development and Selection ...................................................... 5-31
Summary .................................................................................................................. 5-32
C. COMPARISON OF ENvestSCE AND TEEM
IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS ...................................................................................... 5-32

6. CUSTOMER PERCEPTIONS OF ENVESTSCE ......................................................... 6-1
OVERVIEW ............................................................................................................... 6-1
A. FIRST SET OF CUSTOMER INFORMATION IN JUNE - AUGUST, 1995 .............. 6-1
Approach .................................................................................................................. 6-2
PROGRAM DESIGN AND DELIVERY ........................................ 6-4
PREVIOUS INVESTMENTS IN ENERGY EFFICIENCY .................... 6-6
FACTORs INFLUENCING CUSTOMER DECISIONMAKING ................. 6-7
OVERALL CUSTOMER COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS ................. 6-10
B. SECOND SET OF CUSTOMER INTERVIEWS IN MAY, 1996 .......... 6-12
   Overview .................................................. 6-12
   Approach .................................................. 6-12
   Status of Customer's ENvest® Project ......................... 6-13
   Factors Influencing the Customer Decisionmaking Process ..... 6-14
   Customer Satisfaction .................................... 6-17
   Customer Recommendations ................................ 6-20
C. SUMMARY OF CUSTOMER INTERVIEWS CONCERNING ENVEST® ...... 6-21

7. ENERGY SERVICE PROVIDER PERCEPTIONS OF ENVEST® ............ 7-1
OVERVIEW .......................................................... 7-1
A. FIRST SET OF SERVICE PROVIDER INTERVIEWS IN JULY/AUGUST,
   1995 ......................................................... 7-1
   Approach .................................................. 7-1
EXPERIENCES WITH ENvest® NETWORK ................................ 7-2
   Service Provider Network Application and Selection Process ... 7-3
   Marketing .................................................. 7-4
   Work Received ............................................. 7-6
PERCEPTIONS OF ENvest® AS A FACILITATOR OR A COMPETITOR .... 7-8
   Distinctions Between Types of Service Providers ............... 7-8
   Nature of Services Offered By ENvest® and Service Providers ... 7-9
   Project Disaggregation for Bidding .......................... 7-11
   Recommended Role for ENvest® ................................ 7-12
B. SECOND SET OF SERVICE PROVIDER INTERVIEWS IN
   MAY/JUNE, 1996 .............................................. 7-14
   Overview .................................................. 7-14
   Approach .................................................. 7-14
   Background on Service Providers Interviewed .................. 7-14
   Experience with ENvest® ................................... 7-15
   Service Provider Perceptions of the ENvest® Program .......... 7-17
   General Assessment of ENvest® Implementation ................. 7-22
C. SUMMARY OF SERVICE PROVIDERS' PERCEPTIONS OF THE
   ENVEST® PILOT ............................................... 7-25